

Towards an employer engagement toolkit: British teachers' perspectives on the comparative efficacy of work-related learning activities

By Anthony Mann, James Dawkins and Rachael McKeown

Occasional Research Paper 9: January 2017

This publication was developed with the support of:

**THE CAREERS &
ENTERPRISE
COMPANY**

About Education & Employers

www.educationandemployers.org

Education and Employers is a UK charity created in 2009 to ensure that every state school and college has an effective partnership with employers to support young people. As well as undertaking research into the impact and delivery of employer engagement in education, the charity manages innovative programmes to enable schools and colleges to connect efficiently, effectively and equitably with employers including www.inspiringthefuture.org. The charity works in close partnership with the leading national bodies representing education leaders, teaching staff and employers/employees.

Research into employer engagement in education

Education and Employers Research provides a free online resource making high quality materials investigating the impact and delivery of employer engagement in education easily available. Resources include a library of articles and reports, many of which have been summarised to pick out key findings, papers and videos from the Taskforce research conferences and free London seminar series as well as Taskforce publications and a regular e-bulletin of relevant research announcements. Visit: www.educationandemployers.org/research-main

About the authors

Dr Anthony Mann is Director of Policy and Research at Education and Employers. He is the author or co-author of more than thirty publications on employer engagement in education. Joining the charity at its creation, he has led its research function, chairing the Taskforce's annual international research conference and publishing on themes surrounding employer engagement in education, editing (with Julian Stanley and Louise Archer) the first collection of research essays on the subject: *Understanding Employer Engagement in Education* (Routledge, 2014). He is a member of the Editorial Board of the Journal of Education and Work. Anthony often advises government and its agencies on effective approaches to employer engagement in education. He speaks regularly on the subject, addressing audiences recently in Australia, Canada, the US, Greece (CEDEFOP), France (OECD), Denmark, Sweden, Malta and Italy as well as across the UK.

James Dawkins is currently studying for a PhD at University College London and was a former Research Analyst at Education and Employers. He holds a master's degree in social science research methods and has worked at a number of leading policy institutes including the Centre for Economic and Social Inclusion, Reform, and the British Youth Council.

Rachael McKeown is currently undertaking postgraduate studies at the University of Amsterdam. She is a former Research Assistant at Education and Employers. Rachael graduated from UCL with a BA (Hons) degree in Geography, focusing on social mobility and issues of inequality. She has studied trade union engagement within local communities, considering the role of social capital in forming better links and developing fruitful societies. Rachael began her research career by studying higher education healthcare profession courses, examining their efficacy in preparing students for their careers.

For more information about this report, contact: Anthony.Mann@educationandemployers.org, Education and Employers Taskforce, Quantum House, 22-24 Red Lion Court, London, EC4A 3EB.

Summary

The subject of this report is the range of work-related and employer engagement activities commonly used in UK secondary education to enhance the learning and progression of young people. The report asks whether it is possible to distinguish between activities which aim to improve the ultimate success of pupils in education and the labour market in order to enable a more strategic approach to their use in schools and colleges. Over the last generation, UK governments of different political colours have in different ways encouraged, enabled and, at times, required state secondary schools and colleges to adopt teaching approaches and careers activities to better prepare young people for working life. However, the type of activities promoted through such initiatives have been inconsistently evaluated with relative little distinction, in research nor policy, between activities and how young people can be expected to respond to them.

The following analysis explores the question of comparative value of different work-related and employer engagement activities and explicitly investigates what schools staff think about the impact of those activities in terms of pupil employability skills, attainment and progression. The report is based on two premises: that different activities might be used by schools staff to achieve different goals for young people; and, that different types of pupils can be expected to respond to different activities in differing ways.

Methodology

The methodology used to explore these questions is unusual. It effectively crowd sources the informed perspectives of hundreds of secondary school staff. The study presents respondents with a list of sixteen common activities, identifies those which they are familiar and secures their views about the comparative value of such activities in achieving ten different objectives and with five different types of young people. Respondents were asked for their perspectives only on activities which took place in their schools. Survey data was collected initially through the Pearson panel of teaching staff and of members of 1,500 community of teaching staff then registered as users of the www.InspiringtheFuture.org programme. The full sample group was composed of staff members from UK education institutions including: non-selective state schools, selective state schools and independent schools. In all, 390 individuals with experience working with students at Key Stages 3 and 4 completed the survey.

Findings

The study finds that many of the activities are believed to be effective in achieving different outcomes and supporting different types of pupil. In reviewing findings, a number of insights emerge:

- Effective provision involves use of a range of different activities – with an emphasis on real-world experience (direct engagement with workplaces and employee volunteers)
- Different outcomes are better achieved by use of different activities
- Different types of young people respond in different ways to different types of activity

Looking across the activities which are most valued by respondents in securing different outcomes, activities are clustered around three key themes: *Sustained engagement with the working world* (including work experience, mentoring and pupil volunteering in the community); *Career exploration*

and recruitment skills (including careers fairs, CV workshops and mock interviews); *Enterprise activities* (including one day and long form competitions). In addition, activities related to Teaching and Learning are valued individually but do not cluster in support of achievement of specific outcomes tested in this study.

Implications for practice

For practitioners, the implications of this study can be summarised as follows. It is the informed view of surveyed teaching staff that:

- *Pupils should take part in a variety of different work-related activities*
- *Priority should be given to activities involving real-world workplace experience*
- *As a minimum, pupils should take part in one or more activity over key stages 3 and 4 related to:*
 - *Sustained engagement with the working world*
 - *The development of Career exploration and recruitment skills*
 - *Skill development through Enterprise activities*
- *The needs of higher and lower achievers should be considered separately.*

Work-related learning and employer engagement in secondary education¹

The subject of this report is the range of work-related and employer engagement activities commonly used in UK secondary education to enhance the learning and progression of young people. The report asks whether it is possible to distinguish between activities which, in diverse ways, aim to improve the ultimate success of pupils in the labour market by enriching educational experiences with interventions linked to the world of work. Do some activities better serve different objectives than others? Do different types of pupils respond in different ways to different activities? What works best for whom? These are questions which are asked of teaching professionals with first-hand knowledge of the range of work-related activities on which they are asked to comment. In doing so, the report seeks to improve strategic understanding of such interventions to support practitioners in their work.

Over the last generation, UK governments of different political colours have in different ways encouraged, enabled and, at times, required state secondary schools and colleges to adopt teaching approaches and careers activities to better prepare young people for working life. These examples of work-related learning, ranging from the Technical and Vocational Education Initiative of the 1980s to the statutory requirement for work-related learning at Key Stage 4 and the Inspiration Agenda of the current decade have become mainstream elements of British educational experiences. They have, however, historically been inconsistently evaluated (Stanley et al, 2014), but this is changing. A 2016 international literature review of Careers Education commissioned by the Education Endowment Foundation, led by Deirdre Hughes and involving authors of this work, highlighted 73 international research studies undertaken since 1996 which used randomised control trials or quasi-experimental methodologies to quantify the educational, economic and/or social impacts on young people from their participation in a range of careers-focused educational activities.² Considering activities as diverse as mentoring, job shadowing, work experience and careers information, advice and guidance, Hughes and colleagues were able to identify often positive impacts related to specific activities or programmes, the review offered limited insight into the effectiveness of different interventions for different types of students pursuing different objectives (Hughes et al. 2016, 1, 25).

Historically, neither research nor policy literature has made detailed distinction between activities, but interest is not altogether absent. One 2004 MORI survey of 500 Key Stage 4 subject teachers in England commissioned by the Qualifications and Curriculum Authority, for example, asked

¹ Acknowledgements. The research team is hugely grateful to Pearson UK Market Research team for kindly making available its teacher panel for the survey. We are especially grateful to Rob Bristow, Professor Becky Francis and Louis Coiffait for their help and support in undertaking the survey and making sense of the results. We are also grateful to Professor Prue Huddleston (University of Warwick) and Professor Tristram Hooley (Careers and Enterprise Company and the University of Derby) for their valuable comments on early drafts of this paper – and, of course, to the hundreds of members of schools' staff who responded to the surveys. Analysis of the data as presented in this report was made possible by funding from the Careers and Enterprise Company.

² Defined as 'Careers-focused school- or college-mediated provision designed to improve students' education, employment and/or social outcomes' including: career information, advice and guidance, enterprise activities, ICT and careers, job shadowing, mentoring, transformational leadership, volunteering, work experience, and work-related learning.

respondents how ‘important’ a range of different work-related activities were to pupils (see Figure 1). The results show varying levels of enthusiasm for work-related learning activities named with endorsement especially strong for pupil participation within work experience placements and especially weak for involvement in enterprise competitions. While it is possible to distinguish and compare teacher attitudes, no account is given of whether teaching staff had previously observed the activity in question, whether they had specific objectives in mind when offering their perspective or whether different types of pupils might respond in different ways to the activities.

Figure 1. QCA survey of 500 Key Stage 4 teachers in England on the relative importance to pupils of different work-related learning activities (QCA, 2004)

| Activity | Very important | Fairly important | Not very important | Not at all important |
|--|-----------------------|-------------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|
| Do a work placement for a week or more | 79% | 16% | 2% | 3% |
| Develop an awareness of local and national employment opportunities | 53% | 36% | 8% | 3% |
| Develop their skills for career management | 52% | 38% | 4% | 6% |
| Listen or speak with visitors from businesses | 45% | 41% | 9% | 5% |
| Through work-related learning activities to develop skills for enterprise and employability | 44% | 45% | 7% | 4% |
| Use work as a context for learning in the curriculum | 41% | 43% | 10% | 6% |
| Develop their understanding of how business enterprises operate | 23% | 57% | 14% | 6% |
| Take part in an enterprise project or business challenge | 17% | 50% | 20% | 13% |

More recently, the *What Works* approach adopted by the UK Careers and Enterprise Company, established in 2015 to enhance provision of enterprise education, careers education and employer engagement in English schools, is designed to draw explicitly on research findings to enable practitioners to best understand the efficacy of different interventions.³ Hooley (2016), for example, in reviewing literature on employer mentoring points towards its perceived greater comparative effectiveness in supporting educational improvements for borderline or disengaged achievers.

Mann and Kaskefpakdel (2014) have used survey data from 1,000 young British adults aged 19-24 (Figure 2) who had experienced four different work-related school-mediated interventions to explore perceptions of their utility in achieving specific goals within post-secondary transitions.

³ See: The Careers & Enterprise Company. 2016. *What Works in Careers and Enterprise*. London: The Careers & Enterprise Company

Figure 2. Comparative perceptions of helpfulness of four different employer engagement activities – respondents with experience of such activities agreeing that the intervention was at all helpful (or ‘a lot of help’ within parentheses) in achieving outcomes (Mann and Kashefpakdel, 2016).

| Type of activity | % of young adults undertaking activity | Getting a job after education | Deciding on a career | Getting into Higher Education |
|------------------------------------|--|-------------------------------|----------------------|-------------------------------|
| Work experience | 90% | 27% (9%) | 58% (20%) | 27% (7%) |
| Career talks (1-2 times) | 37% | 33% (4%) | 55% (8%) | 32% (6%) |
| Career talks (3 or more) | 13% | 54% (16%) | 84% (28%) | 52% (20%) |
| Mentoring (All types) | 19% | 60% (23%) | 78% (28%) | 62% (18%) |
| Enterprise (Short duration) | 18% | 25% (5%) | 35% (8%) | 28% (4%) |
| Enterprise (Long duration) | 15% | 34% (7%) | 50% (3%) | 50% (8%) |

Mann and Kashefpakdel’s study has the advantage of securing perspectives only from people with declared first-hand experiences of the different activities and finds patterns in the character of young adults’ perceptions. As Figure 2 illustrates, two very different activities – mentoring and three or more career talks – are ranked most highly by young adults with half or more of respondents valuing long form enterprise activities in getting into higher education and work experience in helping decide on a career. While often majorities of respondents did not find the activities useful, this is not always the case. Across five of the six different activities, which vary considerably in terms of time duration, a majority of respondents felt that the intervention was helpful to them in pursuing one of the three objectives. From a qualitative perspective, Mann and Dawkins (2014) have published a small number of focus groups and undertaken semi-structured interviews with teaching staff which explore perceptions of the comparative value of work-related activities. In these sessions, teaching staff have suggested that pupils respond in differing, if broadly predictable, ways to activities.

The aim of this report

The title of this report is *Towards an employer engagement toolkit*.⁴ It explores the question of comparative value of different work-related and employer engagement activities and explicitly

⁴ Aspects of data from the surveys was first published in *Employer Engagement in Education* (Education Development Trust, 2014) by Anthony Mann and James Dawkins. In this Occasional Research Paper, for the first time, the full results of the study are published.

investigates what schools staff think about the impact of those activities. The aim of the work is to harness the insights of professionals well placed to have an informed view about the uses of different activities, which vary widely in intensity and familiarity within schooling, in order to increase the effective use of such resources within toolkits of interventions upon which practitioners can practically draw.

This report begins, therefore, from two premises: that different activities might be used by schools staff to achieve different goals for young people; and, that different types of pupils can be expected to respond to different activities in differing ways. In so doing it makes use of studies that have drawn upon insights from human, social and cultural capital theories: analysis which illustrates the ways in which young people engage in such school-mediated experiences as individuals from distinctive backgrounds (Raffo and Reeves 2000; Stanley and Mann 2014; Jones et al. 2016). The report uses an unusual methodology to explore these questions, effectively crowd sourcing the informed perspectives of hundreds of schools' staff working across secondary education, identifying those activities with which they are familiar and then asking them to share their views about their comparative value in achieving different objectives for different types of young people. Consequently, and importantly, the report only takes account of the teachers' perceptions of activities with which they have first-hand experience. It is only the professionals who have witnessed mentoring in practice in their own schools, for example, who are then prompted to give their view on the comparative value of mentoring as an effective means to secure a specific outcome for a young person.

It is important to note that the report offers no view on the extent to which activities can actually achieve objectives. In securing the view of professionals, however, in some areas it reveals very high levels of agreement that certain interventions should be regarded as effective (however that is understood), while in others it illustrates a high degree of professional uncertainty about what (if anything) works best among the different interventions available. The paper, moreover, offers no opinion on the comprehensive value of the different activities discussed. They may well be used by schools' staff for objectives outside the remit of this paper. The ambition, rather, is to set out the perspectives of professionals about those activities which they have seen in operation in order to understand their views on impacts on young people, with whom they are familiar, towards objectives which are familiar across schools. It then asks whether activities can be grouped to offer a strategic approach to work-related activities within secondary education.

Methodology

Survey data was collected initially from: i) the 5,465 Pearson panel of teaching staff ii) members of the 1,500 community of teaching staff then registered as users of the www.InspiringtheFuture.org programme. Between April and August 2012, the research team submitted surveys to the two panels seeking views from participants with teaching experience at Key Stages 3 and 4. The full sample group was composed of staff members from UK education institutions including: non-selective state schools, selective state schools and independent schools. In all, 390 individuals completed the survey. Respondents were predominantly subject teachers, heads of department and/or members of senior leadership teams.

Respondents were invited to consider a range of 16 common work-related and employer engagement activities and to identify firstly those which were in operation in their own schools. The average number of activities observed was eight. Each respondent was then presented with a new personalised list, including only those activities which they had observed and asked to reflect on the comparative value of the activities in supporting the progress of different types of pupils. In the analysis, Key Stages 3 and 4 are combined to represent ages 11-16 ('secondary school').

The full list of activities respondents were asked to consider was:

Enterprise activities

- One-day enterprise competitions
- Long-form enterprise competitions
- Learner enterprises

Career exploration

- Career talks from employer volunteers / outside professionals
- Career fairs / networking
- Mock interviews with employee volunteers
- Psychometric testing to determine career suitability

Classroom-based activities

- Employee volunteers supporting classroom-based curriculum teaching
- Financial education sessions
- Qualifications related to enterprise and entrepreneurship skills / preparedness for work (Work Related Learning – WRL – Qualifications)
- Learning resources specifically selected due to their relevance to working life

Sustained engagement with working world

- Mentoring by employee volunteers / outside professionals
- Work experience
- Workplace visits
- Job shadowing
- Pupil volunteering in the community

Teachers were asked then for their judgements solely on the value on those specific activities offered to students within their own schools.

The survey began by exploring perceptions of the value of activities with reference to the four employability skills identified within the 2009 synthesising literature review *The Employability Challenge* undertaken by the UK Commission for Employment and Skills.

- Improving Self-management
- Improving Problem solving skills
- Improving Team working and communication skills
- Improving Understanding of the world of work

Specifically, respondents were asked:

In your experience which, if any, of the following activities contribute most to success in these four pupil/learner outcomes (please select up to three activity types for each of the four outcomes)?

Respondents were then questioned about the comparative effectiveness of the activities for pupils in:

- Improving attainment

Respondents were specifically asked:

Do you think that participation in any of these activities has a positive impact on pupil attainment, and if so which ones make the most difference (Please choose up to three activity types)?

Respondents were subsequently asked:

Thinking about pupil progression, which, if any, of these activities best helps young people to progress in their lives (Please choose up to three activity types per progression area):

- Helping broaden and raise aspirations
- Giving a realistic sense of career choices and what needs to be done to secure job objectives
- Giving an advantage in getting attractive part-time work while still in education
- Helping good decision-making about what and where to study next
- Getting on to chosen choice of further study

Activities were also ranked by respondents in terms of their comparative effectiveness in supporting different types of students across different levels of ability. Respondents were asked:

Thinking now about different types of pupils/learners, which of the different activities, in your experience, do you think have the most positive impact on these pupils (Please choose up to three activity types)?

- Low achievers
- Borderline achievers
- High achievers
- Learners with Special Educational Needs
- Disengaged and/or unmotivated learners

The survey was designed, therefore, to capture firstly the perceptions of teaching professionals on which, *if any*, work-related learning activities which they had witnessed were felt to be of value in securing educational and progression outcomes. Secondly, it was structured to understand whether respondents felt that specific activities were of greater or lesser value to different types of pupils. No further definitions were offered to respondents of the different activities and outcomes described.

Findings

The results of the survey are summarised below in the Annex. Respondents reported a widespread familiarity with many of the sixteen activities. As such, the survey captures the insights of professionals at a time of particularly rich engagement across a broad range of activities with pupils aged 14-16.⁵ Summarised in Figure 3 below, more than half of respondents reported first-hand knowledge of ten of the activities and no activity had been observed by less than one quarter of the sample.

Figure 3. Respondent familiarity with work-related learning and employer engagement activities

| | Activity | Respondents having observed | As percentage of total |
|----|------------------------|-----------------------------|------------------------|
| 1 | Work experience | 353/390 | 91% |
| 2 | Career Talks | 350/390 | 90% |
| 3 | Career Fairs | 318/390 | 82% |
| 4 | One day Enterprise | 313/390 | 80% |
| 5 | Mock interviews | 288/390 | 74% |
| 6 | Financial Education | 261/390 | 67% |
| 7 | Workplace Visits | 237/390 | 61% |
| 8 | Long term Enterprise | 231/390 | 59% |
| 9 | Community Volunteering | 213/390 | 55% |
| 10 | Learning Resources | 201/390 | 52% |
| 11 | WRL Qualifications | 183/390 | 47% |
| 12 | Psychometric Tests | 160/390 | 41% |
| 13 | Learner Enterprise | 149/390 | 38% |
| 14 | Curriculum Teaching | 147/390 | 38% |
| 15 | Mentoring | 115/390 | 30% |
| 16 | Job Shadowing | 104/390 | 27% |

In reviewing findings, a number of insights emerge.

Effective provision involves use of a range of different activities – with an emphasis on real-world experience

In Figure 4 below, the full results are summarised in a single document highlighting both the leading five activities identified as being most effective in achieving objectives for pupils and outcomes and incidence where more than 70% of respondents (who had observed an activity) identified that activity as effective. Further summarised at Figure 4, the survey highlights a widespread belief

⁵ Following the introduction of the statutory requirement for work-related learning at key stage 4 in 2004 and prior to its repeal in 2011, secondary schools in England were encouraged and enabled to increase and extend pupil participation in activities described in this report.

among experienced practitioners that more effective provision makes use of a wide range of different activities. Twelve of the sixteen different activities were, at the time of the study, endorsed by 70% or more of respondents as being effective means of achieving one or more outcomes.

| Figure 4. Teacher perspectives on the comparative effectiveness of sixteen activities (UKCES employability skills outcomes and pupil type) | | | | | | | | |
|--|-----------------|-----------------|-------------------------|------------------------------|---------------|----------------------|----------------|-------------------|
| Secondary Schools (KS3+KS4) Respondents: 390 <i>Of activities which have been observed which are most effective in developing skills, supporting specific types of learning, supporting progression. (Number of times cited)</i> | Self-Management | Problem Solving | Team Work/Communication | Understand the World of Work | Low Achievers | Borderline Achievers | High Achievers | Learners with SEN |
| One-day competitions (3) | | 1* | 1** | | | | | |
| Enterprise competitions taking place over a term or longer (5) | 3 | 2* | 2** | | | | 3* | |
| Learner enterprises (e.g. pupil businesses or social enterprises) (2) | | 3 | 4 | | | | | |
| Career talks from employer volunteers/outside professionals (6) | | | | 2** | | | =5 | |
| Career fairs/networking (5) | | | | 4** | | | 1* | |
| Mock interviews with employee volunteers (6) | 5 | | | | =5 | 4 | 2* | |
| Psychometric testing to determine career suitability (1) | | | | | | | | |
| Employee volunteers coming into class to support curriculum teaching (4) | | | | =5* | | 3 | | |
| Dedicated sessions on financial education (2) | 4 | | | | | | 4* | |
| Qualifications related to enterprise and entrepreneurship skills / preparedness for work (4) | | 4 | 5 | | =5 | | | |
| Learning resources specifically selected because they are relevant to working life (5) | | 5 | | =5* | 2 | | | 2 |
| Mentoring by employee volunteers/outside professionals (6) | | | | | 3 | 2 | | |
| Work experience (12) | 2 | | | 1*** | 1* | 1* | | 1* |
| Workplace visits (9) | | | | 3** | 4 | 5 | | 3 |
| Job shadowing (2) | | | | | | | | =4 |
| Pupil/learner volunteering in the community (6) | 1* | | 3 | | | | =5 | =4 |

Key:

* = endorsement by 70% of experienced respondents

** = endorsement by 80% of experienced respondents

*** = endorsement by 90% of experienced respondents

Figure 4 contd. Teacher perspectives on comparative effectiveness of sixteen activities (Pupil type and progression outcome measures)

| Secondary Schools (KS3+KS4) Respondents: 390 <i>Of activities which have been observed which are most effective in developing skills, supporting specific types of learning, supporting progression.</i> (Number of times cited) | Disengaged Learners | Increase Attainment | Broaden aspirations | Understand what's needed to get jobs | Get a Part Time job | Good decision on continuing study | Get onto course of choice if continue studying |
|--|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|--------------------------------------|---------------------|-----------------------------------|--|
| One-day competitions (3) | | 2 | | | | | |
| Enterprise competitions taking place over a term or longer (5) | | 3 | | | | | |
| Learner enterprises (e.g. pupil businesses or social enterprises) (2) | | | | | | | |
| Career talks from employer volunteers/outside professionals (6) | | 5 | =1 | =1* | | 3 | |
| Career fairs/networking (5) | | | | 3* | | 1 | =3 |
| Mock interviews with employee volunteers (6) | | 4 | | | 3 | | |
| Psychometric testing to determine career suitability (1) | | | | =4 | | | |
| Employee volunteers coming into class to support curriculum teaching (4) | 5 | | 5 | | | | |
| Dedicated sessions on financial education (2) | | | | | | | |
| Qualifications related to enterprise and entrepreneurship skills / preparedness for work (4) | | | | | | | 2 |
| Learning resources specifically selected because they are relevant to working life (5) | 4 | | | | | | |
| Mentoring by employee volunteers/outside professionals (6) | 2 | | 3 | | | 2 | 1 |
| Work experience (12) | 1 | 1 | =1 | =1* | 1 | 4 | =3 |
| Workplace visits (9) | 3 | | 4 | =4 | 4 | 5 | |
| Job shadowing (2) | | | | | 5 | | |
| Pupil/learner volunteering in the community (6) | | | | | 2 | | 5 |

Key:

- * = endorsement by 70% of experienced respondents
- ** = endorsement by 80% of experienced respondents
- *** = endorsement by 90% of experienced respondents

It is worthy of note, moreover, that the eight most favoured activities recorded in Figure 5 all typically include direct experience of workplaces, engagement with employee volunteers or provision taking place outside of school (Community Volunteering) compared to only three of the eight less favoured activities.

Figure 5. Respondent identification of most effective activities by top five ranking and selection by 70%+ of respondents

| | Activity | Appearance in top 5 - most effective activity | Selection by 70%+ respondents as most effective activity |
|----|----------------------------------|---|--|
| 1 | Work experience | 12 | 5 |
| 2 | Workplace Visits | 9 | 1 |
| 3 | Career Talks | 6 | 2 |
| 4 | Mock interviews | 6 | 2 |
| 5 | Community Volunteering | 6 | 1 |
| 6 | Mentoring | 6 | - |
| 7 | Career Fairs | 5 | 3 |
| 8 | Long-form Enterprise Competition | 5 | 3 |
| 9 | Learning Resources | 5 | 1 |
| 10 | Curriculum Teaching | 4 | 1 |
| 11 | WRL Qualifications | 4 | - |
| 12 | One day Enterprise | 3 | 2 |
| 13 | Learner Enterprise | 2 | - |
| 14 | Job Shadowing | 2 | 1 |
| 15 | Financial Education | 2 | 1 |
| 16 | Psychometric Testing | 1 | - |

Different outcomes are better achieved by use of different activities

At Figure 6, the survey results are summarised. Asked to identify more effective activities to help pupils achieve specific outcomes, respondents highlighted eleven activities with responses clustered around three primary areas:

Sustained engagement with working world (Work experience, community volunteering and mentoring) seen as being of particular value in developing self-management and accessing part-time work.

Career exploration and recruitment skills (Career talks, fairs and workplace visits) seen as being of particular value in understanding of the work of work, career thinking and decision making.

Enterprise Activities (Long-form and one day enterprise competitions and learner enterprises) seen as being of particular value in developing problem-solving and team working skills.

With other outcomes (understanding the world of work, improving attainment, broadening aspirations and getting onto courses of choice), the perspectives of respondents patterns responses are less striking. Schools’ staff completing the survey demonstrated views here that a mixture of different activities could be effective in achieving outcomes.

Figure 6. Respondent selection of three most effective interventions by objective outcome areas

| | | | | | | |
|---|------------------------|-----|------------------------|-----|------------------------|-----|
| Self-management | Community Volunteering | 72% | Work experience | 67% | Long-form enterprise | 64% |
| Problem solving | One-day enterprise | 78% | Long-form enterprise | 74% | Learner enterprises | 61% |
| Team working & Communications | One-day enterprise | 88% | Long-form enterprise | 81% | Community Volunteering | 68% |
| Understanding world of work | Work experience | 92% | Career talks | 88% | Workplace visits | 87% |
| Improving attainment | Work experience | 58% | One-day enterprise | 38% | Long-form enterprise | 35% |
| Broadening and raising aspirations | Work experience | 58% | Career talks | 58% | Mentoring | 57% |
| Career thinking | Career talks | 77% | Work experience | 74% | Career fairs | 74% |
| Accessing part-time work | Work experience | 62% | Community Volunteering | 56% | Mock interviews | 47% |
| Decision-making | Career fairs | 68% | Mentoring | 63% | Career talks | 61% |
| Getting onto courses of choice | Mentoring | 46% | WRL Qualifications | 44% | Career fairs | 43% |

Different types of young people respond in different ways to different types of activity

In Figure 7 below, the analysis presents teachers’ perspectives on the effectiveness of different activities in relation to specific groups of young people. The faith of teaching staff in work experience in supporting young people at key stage 4 is perhaps most striking. As noted above, work experience was seen as the most important intervention experienced by 14-16 year-old pupils in the 2004 QCA survey, and was the only activity felt by more than half of respondents in the current survey to be effective in improving attainment. In considering which activities are felt to be particularly effective for five specific groups of pupils, on four occasions more than 70% of respondents with experience of work experience identified these placements as being most effective. The finding offers a challenge to policy makers, practitioners and researchers to better understand how engagement in work experience can influence the engagement of young people in education.⁶

Again, patterns can be observed related to thematically grouped activities.

Sustained engagement with working world (Work experience and mentoring) seen as being of particular value in supporting low achievers, borderline achievers and disengaged learners.

Career exploration and recruitment skills (Career fairs and mock interviews) seen as being of particular value in supporting high achievers.

⁶ For an initial discussion, see Mann, A. 2012 *Work experience: Impact and Delivery*. London: Education and Employers; Huddleston, P. (2011) “Pupil Work Experience” in Huddleston, P. and Stanley, J. eds. *Work-related Teaching and Learning*. Abingdon: Routledge

In these findings, it is the perspectives on high performing pupils which most stand out. Here, it is activities which encourage pupils to explore careers options and allow them to test themselves in environments mimicking real-world employment that teaching staff feel are most effective.

Figure 7. Respondent selection of three most effective interventions by pupil type

| | | | | | | |
|--|-----------------|-----|--------------------|-----|----------------------|-----|
| Low achievers | Work experience | 73% | Learning resources | 62% | Mentoring | 57% |
| Borderline achievers | Work experience | 76% | Mentoring | 66% | Curriculum teaching | 65% |
| High achievers | Career fairs | 76% | Mock interviews | 75% | Long-form enterprise | 73% |
| Learners with Special Educational Needs | Work experience | 73% | Learning resources | 53% | Workplace visits | 47% |
| Disengaged learners | Work experience | 70% | Mentoring | 62% | Workplace visits | 59% |

Implications for practice

The typical young British adult leaves schooling having engaged with employers on fewer than two occasions over their secondary education (Kashefpakdel et al. 2016). The evidence presented in this paper, drawing on the perspectives of British teaching staff with first hand experiences of a range of sixteen different work-related activities, many of which involve employer engagement, suggests that this is not enough. Teaching staff believe to a strong degree that participation in most of the activities discussed in this paper helps young people achieve important outcomes within and after schooling. In reviewing the perspectives given, patterns emerge and arguably it is here that the survey's most important insights are to be found. Across a large number of outcome areas and pupil types, two or more of the nominated activities relate to specific forms of work-related engagements. The activities can be clustered within three primary thematic groups. In addition, it is possible to identify a fourth category of activities relating to Teaching and Learning (including Curriculum Teaching, Learning Resources, Financial Education and WRL Qualifications) which while valued individually, collectively do not cluster together in such a coherent manner.

Sustained engagement with the working world

| | | |
|---|---|--|
| Activities | Particularly effective in outcomes: | Particularly effective for pupils: |
| Work experience Community volunteering Mentoring | Self-management Accessing part-time work | Low achievers Borderline achievers Disengaged learners |

Career exploration

| Activities | Particularly effective in outcomes: | Particularly effective for pupils: |
|---|--|------------------------------------|
| Career talks Career fairs Workplace visits Job shadowing Mock interviews Psychometric testing | Understanding of the world of work Career thinking Decision making | High achievers |

Enterprise activities

| Activities | Particularly effective in outcomes: | Particularly effective for pupils: |
|---|--|------------------------------------|
| One-day enterprise competitions Long-form enterprise competitions Learner enterprises | Problem-solving Team working skills | |

Within these activities, it is those which most routinely place pupils into first-hand encounters with workplaces and working professionals, highlighted in bold above, which are most highly regarded by schools' staff. Pupils, teachers collectively argue in this survey, should not be treated as a homogeneous group. They are different – notably by achievement level - and can be expected respond to different activities in different ways.

The report presents a specific challenge to schools, policy makers and researchers with regard to the activity of work experience. Of all 16 activities observed by teachers, it is by far the most highly regarded. Not only is it selected by schools' staff as one of the five most effective activities across twelve of fifteen categories of outcome and pupil type, on nine occasions it appears in the top three and on five occasions is endorsed by more than 70% of respondents with first-hand experience of observing its impact on young people. Such positive perceptions tally with other published data (Mann 2012; QCA 2004) from both teaching staff and pupils. Quantified analysis, however, has only in a very limited way been able to identify positive impacts from participation in work experience in terms of either educational or economic outcomes (Hughes et al. 2016). With pupil participation in work experience at key stage 4 declining rapidly since 2010 (Archer and Moote 2016; QCA 2004) important questions are raised about what may have been lost by young people and the extent to which related, less demanding activities have been able to take its place.

Conclusions

This study explores the perceptions of 390 secondary school staff about the value of 16 different work-related activities which are commonly undertaken by pupils between the ages of 12 to 16. Unusually, the study only asks teaching staff to comment on those activities taking place in their own schools, activities about which they can be expected to hold an informed view as to how pupils react to the different experiences presented. The survey finds widespread awareness of the activities which are clustered around four different types of intervention (*Enterprise activities; Career exploration and recruitment skills; Classroom-based activities; Sustained engagement with working world*). Respondents were asked to identify activities which they felt were particularly effective in helping young people to develop four key employability skills, to increase their attainment and to achieve a range of important outcomes linked to their ultimate progression out of education. Finally, different types of learners, distinguished primarily by attainment levels, were identified and respondents asked if any of the activities were particularly effective in their support.

The study uncovers a widespread belief that many of the activities are effective in achieving different outcomes and supporting different types of pupil. All 16 activities were on at least one occasion listed among the five most effective activities selected by respondents in considering the different outcome areas and pupil types; 12 of the activities were endorsed, on one or more occasion, by 70% or more of respondents with experience of the intervention. In making such selections, respondents most strongly endorsed activities involving direct pupil contacts with workplaces and individuals from the world of work.

Further analysis of the results set out the belief that different objectives (whether employment skills or progression outcomes) are better achieved by use of different activities. Looking specifically at the activities most valued by informed practitioners, responses can be clustered around three key themes: *Sustained engagement with working world; Career exploration and recruitment skills; Enterprise activities*. Turning to different pupil types, the study finds that different types of young people respond in different ways to different types of activity, with again responses clustering on this occasion around two themes: *Sustained engagement with working world; Career exploration and recruitment skills*.

For practitioners, therefore, the implications of this study can be summarised as follows. It is the informed view of teaching staff that:

- *Pupils should take part in a variety of different work-related activities*
- *Priority should be given to activities involving real-world workplace experience*
- *As a minimum, pupils should take part in one or more activity over key stages 3 and 4 related to:*
 - *Sustained engagement with working world*
 - *The development of Career exploration and recruitment skills*
 - *Skill development through Enterprise activities*
- *The needs of higher and lower achievers should be considered separately.*

References

- Archer, L. and Moote, J. 2016. *ASPIRES2 Project Spotlight: Year 11 Students' Views on Career Education and Work Experience*. London: King's College:
<http://www.educationandemployers.org/research/aspires-2-project-spotlight-year-11-students-views-of-careers-education-and-work-experience/>
- The Careers & Enterprise Company. 2016. *What Works in Careers and Enterprise*. London: The Careers & Enterprise Company: <https://www.careersandenterprise.co.uk/research/what-works-careers-and-enterprise>
- Hooley, T. 2016. *Effective Employer Mentoring – Lessons from the Evidence*. London: Careers and Enterprise Company: <https://www.careersandenterprise.co.uk/research/effective-employer-mentoring>
- Huddleston, P. (2011) "Pupil Work Experience" in Huddleston, P. and Stanley, J. eds. *Work-related Teaching and Learning*. Abingdon: Routledge
- Hughes, D., Mann, A., Barnes, S-A., Baldauf, B. and McKeown, R. 2016. *Careers Education: International Literature Review*. London: Education Endowment Foundation:
<http://www.educationandemployers.org/research/careers-education-international-literature-review/>
- Kashefpakdel, E., Mann, A., McKeown, R. and Huddleston, P. 2016. "Contemporary transitions: Young Britons reflect on what helps." Paper given at the *International conference on employer engagement in education and training*, London: <http://www.educationandemployers.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/2.-Anthony-Mann-Barclays.pdf>
- Mann, A and Dawkins, J. 2014. *Teacher and Pupil voices on Employer Engagement: Insights from Three Focus Groups and Semi-structured interviews with five English secondary schools (2011-2012)*. London: Education and Employers: <http://www.educationandemployers.org/research/teacher-and-pupil-voices-on-employer-engagement/>
- Mann, A. and Kashefpakdel, E. 2014. "The views of young Britons (aged 19–24) on their teenage experiences of school-mediated employer engagement" in Mann, A., Stanley, J. and Archer, L. eds. *Understanding Employer Engagement in Education: Theories and Evidence*. London: Routledge.
- Mann, A. 2012 *Work experience: Impact and Delivery*. London: Education and Employers: <http://www.educationandemployers.org/research/work-experience-impact-and-delivery-insights-from-the-evidence/>
- Stanley, J., Mann, A. and Archer, L. 2014. "Introduction" in Mann, A., Stanley, J. and Archer, L. eds. *Understanding Employer Engagement in Education: Theories and Evidence*. London: Routledge.
- Stanley, J. and Mann, A. 2014. "A theoretical framework for employer engagement" in Mann, A., Stanley, J. and Archer, L. eds. *Understanding Employer Engagement in Education: Theories and Evidence*. London: Routledge.

Raffo, C. and Reeves, M. 2000. "Youth Transitions and Social Exclusion: Developments in Social Capital Theory" *Journal of Youth Studies* 3:2, 147-166

Jones, S., Mann, A. and Morris, K. 2016. "The 'Employer Engagement Cycle' in Secondary Education: analysing the testimonies of young British adults" *Journal of Education and Work* 29:7, 834-856: <http://www.educationandemployers.org/research/the-employer-engagement-cycle-in-secondary-education-analysing-the-testimonies-of-young-british-adults/>

Mann, A. and Dawkins, J. 2014. *Employer Engagement in Education*. Reading: Education Development Trust: <https://www.educationdevelopmenttrust.com/en-GB/our-research/our-research-library/2014/r-employer-engagement-2014>

QCA. 2004. *Work-related Learning Baseline study 2004*. London: Qualifications and Curriculum Authority: <http://www.educationandemployers.org/research/work-related-learning-baseline-study-2004/>

UKCES. 2009. *The Employability Challenge*. London: UK Commission for Employment and Skills: <http://www.educationandemployers.org/research/the-employability-challenge-2009/>

Annex

Table 1: Number of teachers who have observed pupil participation in employer engagement activities and have perceived the activity to be effective in facilitating student **self-management**

| Activities | Secondary | | |
|--|--|-----------------------------------|-----------------------|
| | Observation of Pupil Involvement in Activity | Belief that Activity is Effective | Percent |
| One-day competitions | 313 | 123 | 39% |
| Enterprise competitions taking place over a term or longer | 231 | 148 | 64% 3 |
| Learner enterprises (e.g. pupil businesses or social enterprises) | 149 | 73 | 49% |
| Career talks from employer volunteers/outside professionals | 350 | 29 | 8% |
| Career fairs/networking | 318 | 61 | 19% |
| Mock interviews with employee volunteers | 288 | 159 | 55% 5 |
| Psychometric testing to determine career suitability | 160 | 74 | 46% |
| Employee volunteers coming into class to support curriculum teaching | 147 | 15 | 10% |
| Dedicated sessions on financial education | 261 | 155 | 59% 4 |
| Qualifications related to enterprise and entrepreneurship skills / preparedness for work | 183 | 91 | 50% |
| Learning resources specifically selected because they are relevant to working life | 201 | 66 | 33% |
| Mentoring by employee volunteers/outside professionals | 115 | 51 | 44% |
| Work experience | 353 | 243 | 67% 2 |
| Workplace visits | 237 | 63 | 27% |
| Job shadowing | 104 | 34 | 33% |
| Pupil/learner volunteering in the community | 213 | 153 | 72% 1 |

Table 2: Number of teachers who have observed pupil participation in employer engagement activities and have perceived the activity to be effective in developing student **problem solving skills**

| Activities | Secondary | | | |
|---|--|-----------------------------------|------------|----------|
| | Observation of Pupil Involvement in Activity | Belief that Activity is Effective | Percent | |
| One-day competitions | 313 | 243 | 78% | 1 |
| Enterprise competitions taking place over a term or longer | 231 | 170 | 74% | 2 |
| Learner enterprises (e.g. pupil businesses or social enterprises) | 149 | 91 | 61% | 3 |
| Career talks from employer volunteers/outside professionals | 350 | 14 | 4% | |
| Career fairs/networking | 318 | 10 | 3% | |
| Mock interviews with employee volunteers | 288 | 34 | 12% | |
| Psychometric testing to determine career suitability | 160 | 25 | 16% | |
| Employee volunteers coming into class to support curriculum teaching | 147 | 28 | 19% | |
| Dedicated sessions on financial education | 261 | 112 | 43% | |
| Qualifications related to enterprise and entrepreneurship skills / preparedness for work | 183 | 90 | 49% | 4 |
| Learning resources specifically selected because they are relevant to working life | 201 | 88 | 44% | 5 |
| Mentoring by employee volunteers/outside professionals | 115 | 17 | 15% | |
| Work experience | 353 | 126 | 36% | |
| Workplace visits | 237 | 32 | 14% | |
| Job shadowing | 104 | 13 | 13% | |
| Pupil/learner volunteering in the community | 213 | 84 | 39% | |

Table 3: Number of teachers who have observed pupil participation in employer engagement activities and have perceived the activity to be effective in developing student **team working and communication skills**

| Activities | Secondary | | | |
|---|--|-----------------------------------|------------|----------|
| | Observation of Pupil Involvement in Activity | Belief that Activity is Effective | Percent | |
| One-day competitions | 313 | 276 | 88% | 1 |
| Enterprise competitions taking place over a term or longer | 231 | 188 | 81% | 2 |
| Learner enterprises (e.g. pupil businesses or social enterprises) | 149 | 94 | 63% | 4 |
| Career talks from employer volunteers/outside professionals | 350 | 28 | 8% | |
| Career fairs/networking | 318 | 30 | 9% | |
| Mock interviews with employee volunteers | 288 | 59 | 20% | |
| Psychometric testing to determine career suitability | 160 | 8 | 5% | |
| Employee volunteers coming into class to support curriculum teaching | 147 | 41 | 28% | |
| Dedicated sessions on financial education | 261 | 112 | 43% | |
| Qualifications related to enterprise and entrepreneurship skills / preparedness for work | 183 | 90 | 49% | 5 |
| Learning resources specifically selected because they are relevant to working life | 201 | 88 | 44% | |
| Mentoring by employee volunteers/outside professionals | 115 | 17 | 15% | |
| Work experience | 353 | 126 | 36% | |
| Workplace visits | 237 | 32 | 14% | |
| Job shadowing | 104 | 35 | 34% | |
| Pupil/learner volunteering in the community | 213 | 144 | 68% | 3 |

Table 4: Number of teachers who have observed pupil participation in employer engagement activities and have perceived the activity to be effective in improving student **understanding of the world of work**

| Activities | Secondary | | | |
|---|--|-----------------------------------|------------|-----------|
| | Observation of Pupil Involvement in Activity | Belief that Activity is Effective | Percent | |
| One-day competitions | 313 | 78 | 25% | |
| Enterprise competitions taking place over a term or longer | 231 | 106 | 46% | |
| Learner enterprises (e.g. pupil businesses or social enterprises) | 149 | 55 | 37% | |
| Career talks from employer volunteers/outside professionals | 350 | 309 | 88% | 2 |
| Career fairs/networking | 318 | 266 | 84% | 4 |
| Mock interviews with employee volunteers | 288 | 208 | 72% | |
| Psychometric testing to determine career suitability | 160 | 56 | 35% | |
| Employee volunteers coming into class to support curriculum teaching | 147 | 114 | 78% | =5 |
| Dedicated sessions on financial education | 261 | 102 | 39% | |
| Qualifications related to enterprise and entrepreneurship skills / preparedness for work | 183 | 117 | 64% | |
| Learning resources specifically selected because they are relevant to working life | 201 | 156 | 78% | =5 |
| Mentoring by employee volunteers/outside professionals | 115 | 76 | 66% | |
| Work experience | 353 | 325 | 92% | 1 |
| Workplace visits | 237 | 210 | 87% | 3 |
| Job shadowing | 104 | 80 | 77% | |
| Pupil/learner volunteering in the community | 213 | 133 | 62% | |

Table 5: Number of teachers who have observed pupil participation in employer engagement activities and have perceived the activity to be effective in improving student **attainment**

| Activities | Secondary | | | |
|--|--|-----------------------------------|------------|----------|
| | Observation of Pupil Involvement in Activity | Belief that Activity is Effective | Percent | |
| One-day competitions | 313 | 120 | 38% | 2 |
| Enterprise competitions taking place over a term or longer | 231 | 82 | 35% | 3 |
| Learner enterprises (e.g. pupil businesses or social enterprises) | 149 | 31 | 21% | |
| Career talks from employer volunteers/outside professionals | 350 | 117 | 33% | 5 |
| Career fairs/networking | 318 | 66 | 21% | |
| Mock interviews with employee volunteers | 288 | 97 | 34% | 4 |
| Psychometric testing to determine career suitability | 160 | 14 | 9% | |
| Employee volunteers coming into class to support curriculum teaching | 147 | 27 | 18% | |
| Dedicated sessions on financial education | 261 | 26 | 10% | |
| Qualifications related to enterprise and entrepreneurship skills / preparedness for work | 183 | 45 | 25% | |
| Learning resources specifically selected because they are relevant to working life | 201 | 43 | 21% | |
| Mentoring by employee volunteers/outside professionals | 115 | 36 | 31% | |
| Work experience | 353 | 203 | 58% | 1 |
| Workplace visits | 237 | 76 | 32% | |
| Job shadowing | 104 | 17 | 16% | |
| Pupil/learner volunteering in the community | 213 | 43 | 20% | |

Table 6: Number of teachers who have observed pupil participation in employer engagement activities and have perceived the activity to be effective in helping pupils **broaden and raise their aspirations**

| Activities | Secondary | | |
|---|--|-----------------------------------|---------------|
| | Observation of Pupil Involvement in Activity | Belief that Activity is Effective | Percent |
| One-day competitions | 313 | 106 | 34% |
| Enterprise competitions taking place over a term or longer | 231 | 108 | 47% |
| Learner enterprises (e.g. pupil businesses or social enterprises) | 149 | 52 | 35% |
| Career talks from employer volunteers/outside professionals | 350 | 203 | 58% =1 |
| Career fairs/networking | 318 | 142 | 45% |
| Mock interviews with employee volunteers | 288 | 110 | 38% |
| Psychometric testing to determine career suitability | 160 | 52 | 33% |
| Employee volunteers coming into class to support curriculum teaching | 147 | 76 | 52% 5 |
| Dedicated sessions on financial education | 261 | 46 | 18% |
| Qualifications related to enterprise and entrepreneurship skills / preparedness for work | 183 | 63 | 34% |
| Learning resources specifically selected because they are relevant to working life | 201 | 62 | 31% |
| Mentoring by employee volunteers/outside professionals | 115 | 65 | 57% 3 |
| Work experience | 353 | 206 | 58% =1 |
| Workplace visits | 237 | 131 | 55% 4 |
| Job shadowing | 104 | 44 | 42% |
| Pupil/learner volunteering in the community | 213 | 76 | 36% |

Table 7: Number of teachers who have observed pupil participation in employer engagement activities and have perceived the activity to be effective in **giving students a realistic sense of career choices and what they need to do to secure their job objectives**

| Activities | Secondary | | |
|--|--|-----------------------------------|---------------|
| | Observation of Pupil Involvement in Activity | Belief that Activity is Effective | Percent |
| One-day competitions | 313 | 71 | 23% |
| Enterprise competitions taking place over a term or longer | 231 | 94 | 41% |
| Learner enterprises (e.g. pupil businesses or social enterprises) | 149 | 56 | 38% |
| Career talks from employer volunteers/outside professionals | 350 | 268 | 77% =1 |
| Career fairs/networking | 318 | 236 | 74% =3 |
| Mock interviews with employee volunteers | 288 | 123 | 43% |
| Psychometric testing to determine career suitability | 160 | 108 | 68% =5 |
| Employee volunteers coming into class to support curriculum teaching | 147 | 83 | 56% |
| Dedicated sessions on financial education | 261 | 79 | 30% |
| Qualifications related to enterprise and entrepreneurship skills / preparedness for work | 183 | 83 | 45% |
| Learning resources specifically selected because they are relevant to working life | 201 | 104 | 52% |
| Mentoring by employee volunteers/outside professionals | 115 | 66 | 57% |
| Work experience | 353 | 271 | 77% =1 |
| Workplace visits | 237 | 162 | 68% =5 |
| Job shadowing | 104 | 66 | 63% |
| Pupil/learner volunteering in the community | 213 | 103 | 48% |

Table 8: Number of teachers who have observed pupil participation in employer engagement activities and have perceived the activity to be effective in **giving students an advantage in getting attractive part-time work while still in education**

| Activities | Secondary | | | |
|--|--|-----------------------------------|------------|----------|
| | Observation of Pupil Involvement in Activity | Belief that Activity is Effective | Percent | |
| One-day competitions | 313 | 18 | 6% | |
| Enterprise competitions taking place over a term or longer | 231 | 38 | 16% | |
| Learner enterprises (e.g. pupil businesses or social enterprises) | 149 | 36 | 24% | |
| Career talks from employer volunteers/outside professionals | 350 | 57 | 16% | |
| Career fairs/networking | 318 | 48 | 15% | |
| Mock interviews with employee volunteers | 288 | 136 | 47% | 3 |
| Psychometric testing to determine career suitability | 160 | 15 | 9% | |
| Employee volunteers coming into class to support curriculum teaching | 147 | 25 | 17% | |
| Dedicated sessions on financial education | 261 | 69 | 26% | |
| Qualifications related to enterprise and entrepreneurship skills / preparedness for work | 183 | 56 | 31% | |
| Learning resources specifically selected because they are relevant to working life | 201 | 34 | 17% | |
| Mentoring by employee volunteers/outside professionals | 115 | 29 | 25% | |
| Work experience | 353 | 219 | 62% | 1 |
| Workplace visits | 237 | 102 | 43% | 4 |
| Job shadowing | 104 | 34 | 33% | 5 |
| Pupil/learner volunteering in the community | 213 | 120 | 56% | 2 |

Table 9: Number of teachers who have observed pupil participation in employer engagement activities and have perceived the activity to be effective in **helping students to make good decisions about what and where to study next**

| Activities | Secondary | | |
|--|--|-----------------------------------|---------------------|
| | Observation of Pupil Involvement in Activity | Belief that Activity is Effective | Percent |
| One-day competitions | 313 | 60 | 19% |
| Enterprise competitions taking place over a term or longer | 231 | 67 | 29% |
| Learner enterprises (e.g. pupil businesses or social enterprises) | 149 | 44 | 30% |
| Career talks from employer volunteers/outside professionals | 350 | 215 | 61% 3 |
| Career fairs/networking | 318 | 216 | 68% 1 |
| Mock interviews with employee volunteers | 288 | 101 | 35% |
| Psychometric testing to determine career suitability | 160 | 87 | 54% |
| Employee volunteers coming into class to support curriculum teaching | 147 | 60 | 41% |
| Dedicated sessions on financial education | 261 | 89 | 34% |
| Qualifications related to enterprise and entrepreneurship skills / preparedness for work | 183 | 74 | 40% |
| Learning resources specifically selected because they are relevant to working life | 201 | 95 | 47% |
| Mentoring by employee volunteers/outside professionals | 115 | 73 | 63% 2 |
| Work experience | 353 | 206 | 58% 4 |
| Workplace visits | 237 | 130 | 55% 5 |
| Job shadowing | 104 | 46 | 44% |
| Pupil/learner volunteering in the community | 213 | 78 | 37% |

Table 10: Number of teachers who have observed pupil participation in employer engagement activities and have perceived the activity to be effective in helping students **get onto courses of choice if continuing to study**

| Activities | Secondary | | |
|---|--|-----------------------------------|---------------|
| | Observation of Pupil Involvement in Activity | Belief that Activity is Effective | Percent |
| One-day competitions | 313 | 33 | 11% |
| Enterprise competitions taking place over a term or longer | 231 | 38 | 16% |
| Learner enterprises (e.g. pupil businesses or social enterprises) | 149 | 32 | 21% |
| Career talks from employer volunteers/outside professionals | 350 | 96 | 27% |
| Career fairs/networking | 318 | 138 | 43% =3 |
| Mock interviews with employee volunteers | 288 | 109 | 38% |
| Psychometric testing to determine career suitability | 160 | 37 | 23% |
| Employee volunteers coming into class to support curriculum teaching | 147 | 24 | 16% |
| Dedicated sessions on financial education | 261 | 26 | 10% |
| Qualifications related to enterprise and entrepreneurship skills / preparedness for work | 183 | 81 | 44% 2 |
| Learning resources specifically selected because they are relevant to working life | 201 | 64 | 32% |
| Mentoring by employee volunteers/outside professionals | 115 | 53 | 46% 1 |
| Work experience | 353 | 152 | 43% =3 |
| Workplace visits | 237 | 69 | 29% |
| Job shadowing | 104 | 36 | 35% |
| Pupil/learner volunteering in the community | 213 | 90 | 42% 5 |

Table 11: Number of teachers who have observed pupil participation in employer engagement activities and have perceived the activity to be particularly effective for **low achieving students**

| Activities | Secondary | | | |
|---|--|-----------------------------------|------------|-----------|
| | Observation of Pupil Involvement in Activity | Belief that Activity is Effective | Percent | |
| One-day competitions | 313 | 117 | 37% | |
| Enterprise competitions taking place over a term or longer | 231 | 55 | 24% | |
| Learner enterprises (e.g. pupil businesses or social enterprises) | 149 | 49 | 33% | |
| Career talks from employer volunteers/outside professionals | 350 | 98 | 28% | |
| Career fairs/networking | 318 | 80 | 25% | |
| Mock interviews with employee volunteers | 288 | 114 | 50% | =5 |
| Psychometric testing to determine career suitability | 160 | 58 | 36% | |
| Employee volunteers coming into class to support curriculum teaching | 147 | 66 | 45% | |
| Dedicated sessions on financial education | 261 | 85 | 33% | |
| Qualifications related to enterprise and entrepreneurship skills / preparedness for work | 183 | 91 | 50% | =5 |
| Learning resources specifically selected because they are relevant to working life | 201 | 124 | 62% | 2 |
| Mentoring by employee volunteers/outside professionals | 115 | 65 | 57% | 3 |
| Work experience | 353 | 257 | 73% | 1 |
| Workplace visits | 237 | 123 | 52% | 4 |
| Job shadowing | 104 | 39 | 38% | |
| Pupil/learner volunteering in the community | 213 | 105 | 49% | |

Table 12: Number of teachers who have observed pupil participation in employer engagement activities and have perceived the activity to be particularly effective for **borderline achievers**

| Activities | Secondary | | | |
|--|--|-----------------------------------|------------|----------|
| | Observation of Pupil Involvement in Activity | Belief that Activity is Effective | Percent | |
| One-day competitions | 313 | 175 | 56% | |
| Enterprise competitions taking place over a term or longer | 231 | 91 | 39% | |
| Learner enterprises (e.g. pupil businesses or social enterprises) | 149 | 65 | 44% | |
| Career talks from employer volunteers/outside professionals | 350 | 179 | 51% | |
| Career fairs/networking | 318 | 136 | 43% | |
| Mock interviews with employee volunteers | 288 | 175 | 61% | 4 |
| Psychometric testing to determine career suitability | 160 | 83 | 52% | |
| Employee volunteers coming into class to support curriculum teaching | 147 | 95 | 65% | 3 |
| Dedicated sessions on financial education | 261 | 134 | 51% | |
| Qualifications related to enterprise and entrepreneurship skills / preparedness for work | 183 | 101 | 55% | |
| Learning resources specifically selected because relevant to working life | 201 | 111 | 55% | |
| Mentoring by employee volunteers/outside professionals | 115 | 76 | 66% | 2 |
| Work experience | 353 | 269 | 76% | 1 |
| Workplace visits | 237 | 142 | 60% | 5 |
| Job shadowing | 104 | 45 | 43% | |
| Pupil/learner volunteering in the community | 213 | 112 | 53% | |

Table 13: Number of teachers who have observed pupil participation in employer engagement activities and have perceived the activity to be particularly effective for **high achieving students**

| Activities | Secondary | | |
|--|--|-----------------------------------|------------------------|
| | Observation of Pupil Involvement in Activity | Belief that Activity is Effective | Percent |
| One-day competitions | 313 | 208 | 66% |
| Enterprise competitions taking place over a term or longer | 231 | 169 | 73% 3 |
| Learner enterprises (e.g. pupil businesses or social enterprises) | 149 | 78 | 52% |
| Career talks from employer volunteers/outside professionals | 350 | 228 | 65% =5 |
| Career fairs/networking | 318 | 241 | 76% 1 |
| Mock interviews with employee volunteers | 288 | 217 | 75% 2 |
| Psychometric testing to determine career suitability | 160 | 101 | 63% |
| Employee volunteers coming into class to support curriculum teaching | 147 | 66 | 45% |
| Dedicated sessions on financial education | 261 | 186 | 71% 4 |
| Qualifications related to enterprise and entrepreneurship skills / preparedness for work | 183 | 79 | 43% |
| Learning resources specifically selected because they are relevant to working life | 201 | 86 | 43% |
| Mentoring by employee volunteers/outside professionals | 115 | 48 | 42% |
| Work experience | 353 | 227 | 64% |
| Workplace visits | 237 | 123 | 52% |
| Job shadowing | 104 | 61 | 59% |
| Pupil/learner volunteering in the community | 213 | 138 | 65% =5 |

Table 14: Number of teachers who have observed pupil participation in employer engagement activities and have perceived the activity to be particularly effective for **learners with Special Educational Needs**

| Activities | Secondary | | | |
|---|--|-----------------------------------|------------|-----------|
| | Observation of Pupil Involvement in Activity | Belief that Activity is Effective | Percent | |
| One-day competitions | 313 | 96 | 31% | |
| Enterprise competitions taking place over a term or longer | 231 | 50 | 22% | |
| Learner enterprises (e.g. pupil businesses or social enterprises) | 149 | 42 | 28% | |
| Career talks from employer volunteers/outside professionals | 350 | 86 | 25% | |
| Career fairs/networking | 318 | 68 | 21% | |
| Mock interviews with employee volunteers | 288 | 96 | 33% | |
| Psychometric testing to determine career suitability | 160 | 44 | 28% | |
| Employee volunteers coming into class to support curriculum teaching | 147 | 55 | 37% | |
| Dedicated sessions on financial education | 261 | 85 | 33% | |
| Qualifications related to enterprise and entrepreneurship skills / preparedness for work | 183 | 70 | 38% | |
| Learning resources specifically selected because they are relevant to working life | 201 | 106 | 53% | 2 |
| Mentoring by employee volunteers/outside professionals | 115 | 41 | 36% | |
| Work experience | 353 | 223 | 63% | 1 |
| Workplace visits | 237 | 112 | 47% | 3 |
| Job shadowing | 104 | 41 | 39% | =4 |
| Pupil/learner volunteering in the community | 213 | 84 | 39% | =4 |

Table 15: Number of teachers who have observed pupil participation in employer engagement activities and have perceived the activity to be particularly effective for **disengaged and/or unmotivated learners**

| Activities | Secondary | | | |
|---|--|-----------------------------------|------------|----------|
| | Observation of Pupil Involvement in Activity | Belief that Activity is Effective | Percent | |
| One-day competitions | 313 | 140 | 45% | |
| Enterprise competitions taking place over a term or longer | 231 | 44 | 19% | |
| Learner enterprises (e.g. pupil businesses or social enterprises) | 149 | 41 | 28% | |
| Career talks from employer volunteers/outside professionals | 350 | 135 | 39% | |
| Career fairs/networking | 318 | 82 | 26% | |
| Mock interviews with employee volunteers | 288 | 100 | 35% | |
| Psychometric testing to determine career suitability | 160 | 46 | 29% | |
| Employee volunteers coming into class to support curriculum teaching | 147 | 70 | 48% | 5 |
| Dedicated sessions on financial education | 261 | 61 | 23% | |
| Qualifications related to enterprise and entrepreneurship skills / preparedness for work | 183 | 71 | 39% | |
| Learning resources specifically selected because they are relevant to working life | 201 | 103 | 51% | 4 |
| Mentoring by employee volunteers/outside professionals | 115 | 71 | 62% | 2 |
| Work experience | 353 | 248 | 70% | 1 |
| Workplace visits | 237 | 139 | 59% | 3 |
| Job shadowing | 104 | 45 | 43% | |
| Pupil/learner volunteering in the community | 213 | 92 | 43% | |